

**15<sup>th</sup> ANNUAL GESU SYMPOSIUM ON TRANSFORMING INNER-CITY EDUCATION**  
**Financing Futures: The Funding Challenges Facing Inner-City Catholic Schools**

December 5, 2012

2:00 - 4:00 p.m.

**Panelists:**

- Anne Marie Borneman, Ed.D., *Senior Fellow, Center for Catholic Urban Education at Saint Joseph's University*
- Jason Budd, *Deputy Secretary for Catholic Education, Archdiocese of Philadelphia*
- Bryan H. Carter, *President and CEO, Gesu School*
- John J. DiIulio, Jr., Ph.D., *Frederic Fox Leadership Professor of Politics, Religion, and Civil Society, University of Pennsylvania*
- Victoria Kim Flaville, *Senior Vice President, Programs & Chief Operating Officer, Connelly Foundation*

**Moderator:**

- Loraine Ballard Morrill, *News Director and Community Affairs Director, Clear Channel Media+ Entertainment's six Philadelphia stations: Power 99 FM, WDAS FM, Radio 104.5 FM, Mix 106.1 FM, 1480 WDAS AM and Q102 FM*

**TRANSCRIPTION OF PROCEEDINGS**

Performance of "God Favored Me" by the Gesu Gospel Choir Directed by H. L. Ratliff.

Jelani: My name is Jelani H\_\_. I am in 8<sup>th</sup> grade here at Gesu, and it is my privilege to welcome you to our 15<sup>th</sup> Annual Symposium. My nine years at Gesu have been most productive. I wish to pursue a career as a journalist. Dr. Erwin's advanced writing class is a perfect example of how Gesu has nurtured my passion for writing. I know that from the moment I entered Gesu the faculty and staff were going to build my wings to fly to greatness. My Gesu family has always constructed my wings with love, support, patience and knowledge. It is now my great pleasure to present to you our Gesu board member, **Lou Pichini**. [Applause]

LP: Thank you for that introduction. What I'm about to say, I was invited by Bryan Carter our wonderful president of Gesu, to say a few words about the school. And every time I do any kind of public speaking because I'm so compulsive, I write out the words, I was in court most of the time, and I'd write my closing argument and I'd write every single word. This is three minutes, it's going to be significantly less. But as I was listening to Mr. H\_\_ I was thinking that whatever my written or my spoken words are about Gesu, and I think the world of Gesu, like all of you who have mission schools with respect to your mission schools think the same of those, and I can extoll the virtues, I thought,

whatever those words are, they're really inadequate in describing Gesu, compared to what you just saw and what you just heard, because what you just saw and what you just heard are what Gesu is all about, because that really captures what you're talking about when you have this 8<sup>th</sup> grader who comes in – and I've been doing public speaking for forty years, I'm a reformed trial lawyer, and if you heard that, if you heard the poise, if you heard the intonations, and you heard how he waited and how he timed things, he's in 8<sup>th</sup> grade. Okay. He's in 8<sup>th</sup> grade and the other thing to remember, the other thing to remember is, where do you think he started? Let's start where this school starts, with open admissions. This is not the kind of school that restricts these classrooms to those who are only the best and the brightest. No. What Gesu does is take them without restrictions, those children within a six designated zip code, it takes them, and it transforms them into the best and brightest that each can possibly be. And when you think about it, that's going to be a very tall order. And the reason it's a very tall order, is think about this: number one, half the population that we're talking about lives below the poverty line; number two, only 55% have high school educations; number three, many start two years behind others academically when they start here in Kindergarten. Some could call that "three strikes." Some could call that "you're out." Not at Gesu. Because what Gesu does, it gives them hope. It not only gives them hope, it gives them a whole education so that 90% of them graduate from high school. They graduate from schools like the Prep next door, from Shipley. They also then go on – 63% of them then go on to college. What you're talking about that there is something magical that happens. And I actually saw that this weekend because we had the strategic planning process that was going on. And that strategic planning process – I'd like you to know just parenthetically I'm missing the page of my notes that deals with this so I'm going completely off the cuff. Okay, I'm looking down and I figured, I left my note back there on my chair, but that's okay because I have experience in not remembering, and I'm going to keep this to a minimum, but in that strategic planning process I was part of the programs, the education programs. So I've had this absolutely life-altering experience of watching the education of the school, starting with Sr. Ellen, who by the way, should be Saint Ellen, where is Saint Ellen back there. And then what you also have is Sue Shea who was there, you have Angela Keeler who was there, you have also some of the other people who are administrators here. And then what happens is we talk about how we could improve things with an emphasis on innovation. What happened is Angela started talking about how she teaches. And as she started talking about how she teaches and how she really emphasizes individual respect for each other, how she emphasizes teaming, collaboration, how she emphasizes everything thought-provoking, how she did all of this within the school, as you're sitting there, you're thinking, I want to be in your classroom, because she had a very calming effect, even on me. Okay. But the best part of it is that we had Dr. Jeanne Brady. See, John's here shaking his head, from Saint Joe's. And as Angela was

saying each thing, Jeanne was saying “That’s innovative here. That’s innovative here. That’s innovative here. That’s innovative here.” And that’s what you have. So then you come away with the feeling, my gosh, here’s what happens in this school. Here’s what happens that produces these kids, that understand and produces them for life. And that’s what we’re talking about with the inner-city mission schools. That’s what the point of the schools is. And let me tell you something else that I felt here. Something else that I felt was beyond that. What I felt was the devotion, the commitment and the love that this school represents, and that the other mission schools represent. And I’m telling you, it’s that devotion, that commitment and love. Why can’t every inner-city school have that? Why should they be deprived of that? Why should they be deprived of their hope? Of course, now, this brings us back to the panel. Because what I just said for the previous three or four minutes is why we have to have schools like Gesu not only sustain itself but expand itself. It has to exist in this inner city as the other mission schools do, because if they don’t, and the way that we have to do this, is we come back to finances. We’ve talked about mission. Do you see the passion I have for this school? The passion I have for this school, is I have this absolutely nightmare that we’re not going to be able to finance this. That we’re not going to be able to. You saw the choir that was here. Do you know that the experiences they have of being here and singing to you, and what kind of learning experience that is? And just think, if those kids don’t have that. How are they going to prepare, when they leave this school, when they go out into life. And that type of stuff is life experiences. But my mission as a board member is to make sure we have finances. If we don’t have the kind of financial support for this school and the other mission schools, what we are doing, which we cannot let happen, is extinguish hope for these kids. That cannot happen. With that we’re going to turn this over to the panel who’s going to tell us how it’s going to happen, but by the way, I found page six. Page six happened to be after page eight. All right. And to, just by the way, these are all wonderful panel members, I just wanted to note on a personal note that John DiIulio, he is not only a wonderful professor, he is a wonderful human being. He, my son’s at Fordham. He went to the Prep. He didn’t get into Penn. And the kid was going to jump off a bridge when he found out that he didn’t get into Penn. John is not only a professor. We absolutely should call him the Monsignor because the kind of counseling that he gave to me in email, which I was sharing with my son was something that was absolutely priceless, because all of us as parents, we always have to be there in the crisis situation. You know, John was there for me in a crisis situation, and John, I just wanted to publicly thank you for that.

Break in recording

MOD: Our challenge today is about the challenges facing inner-city Catholic schools as it relates to funding. So what I’m going to do is, I’m going to introduce the panel members. I’m going to give you a short introduction, there’s lots more to say about each one of them,

they are all extraordinarily accomplished in their own way, but I think what ties them all together is that they are all the beneficiaries of a Catholic education.

So I'm going to begin on my right, your left:

**Bryan Carter** who is president and CEO of Gesu School. He has come full circle, the nationally renowned independent Catholic school, which Gesu is serving North Philadelphia. He credits his Catholic grade school and Jesuit high school education with helping him face the challenges of growing up in a single parent household along with five brothers in the heart of Cleveland. He knows the power of a quality education. He has been in the world as national adoption agency, The Cradle's development director and he is here now doing the wonderful work that he is doing.

As you heard before. **Dr. John Dilulio, Jr.**, he is the Frederic Fox Leadership Professor of Politics, Religion and Civil Society at the University of Pennsylvania. He directs the Fox Leadership program for undergraduates and also its religion research program. He was the first in his family to attend college, he majored in economics at Penn, received his Ph.D. in government from Harvard, the guy is highly educated and I believe I first heard of him in an article in *The New Yorker* magazine about the work that he is doing to end violence in our communities and doing it in a very effective and insightful way. So we're very lucky indeed to have him.

Next we have **Kim Flaville** who is senior vice president of programs and chief operating officer for the Connelly Foundation. She is with an organization which strives to foster learning and to improve the quality of life in the greater Philadelphia region through support of education, the arts, culture and human services organizations. Her responsibilities include review of proposals from nonprofit organizations as well as the overall strategy and development of the foundation's outreach initiatives designed to increase access and enhance the curriculum for Archdiocesan schools and parish elementary schools, clearly someone you want to get to know up close and personal.

And then we move on and let me go through my notes here, **Jason Budd** is next, deputy secretary for Catholic education for the Archdiocese of Philadelphia. He assumed the position in 2011. He serves as an advocate for the Archdiocese elementary and secondary schools in government matters, involved in overseeing government programs in the Catholic schools and worked extensively with local law makers to enact legislation now known as the Opportunity Scholarship Tax Credit Program of which I'm sure we'll be speaking about more today. Scholarships through this program are funded by the Pennsylvania Commonwealth business owners and create many new opportunities for school choice by allotting monies to be awarded to qualifying students to attend non-public as well as participating parochial schools.

**Anne Marie Borneman**, who is a senior fellow at the Center for Catholic Urban Education at Saint Joseph's University. She earned her Bachelor of Science degrees in elementary and special education from Cabrini. Her Master of Arts in human development and school psychology certificate from Bryn Mawr College, as I said these are highly educated people here, in addition to her certification in special and elementary education.

#### Break in Recording

We want to do a little bit of discussion, we're really going to encourage you to join the conversation and really get some dialog going. So please start thinking of things that you might want to ask our panelists or ideas and thoughts that you might have.

MOD: So we begin with Bryan Carter.

BC: Thank you, Loraine, and on behalf of 450 dedicated students thank you so much for coming out today and joining us for this symposium. I love talking about Gesu School but I think I found someone that parallels me in that regard and so thank you Lou for being so passionate about our students. To give you a little bit of history about Gesu School we were closed as a parish school in 1993. So what that means is we're now an independent Catholic school and have been since 1993 obviously. The bigger part of that is we no longer receive, or haven't received funding through the Archdiocese which means we have to raise the money to keep the school open. Since 1993 we've had to raise upwards of \$3 million each and every year so that we can welcome our children back in September. We've been blessed to be able to do that and I know we'll be able to do that going forward, but that's one of the biggest funding questions that we have when you look at Gesu School. How can we continue to provide for the children, who as Lou mentioned, reside in the number one zip code of all 46 zip codes in the City of Philadelphia, the number one in terms of the highest percentage of families living at or below the poverty level. So, the parents want their children to come to this school, but we're a tuition-based school obviously, but the difference is the parents can't afford to pay the tuition. So we have to therefore in terms of meeting our mission to serve these children, our neighbor children and provide them with a quality education we have to raise the money. Tell the story to people with whom our mission will resonate so that then they can say yes, I want to support that student and I want to support that school. So what we're looking at now is, when you look at the educational landscape it's a little bit fragmented because you have Faith in the Future for Catholic high schools. We have the Independent Mission Schools for that segment of Catholic elementary schools. You have Philadelphia School Partnership, which I think we'll talk about their good fortune that they learned of today and then you have independent schools like Gesu, which is a singular school. So we have to figure out, all of us, how we continue to provide a quality

education for children residing in the inner city and the zip code surrounding Gesu, and other schools as well, how we are able to fund that for the children when it's a fragmented landscape. So for example, me as president of Gesu, I'll approach someone and tell our story and it's a wonderful story. But then there may be someone else representing another portfolio of schools that will have a similar message and that donor or that organization will have to make a decision as to, do I fund Gesu because it's a wonderful school, do I fund this consortium of schools because it's affecting a lot of schools as well. So that's the challenge that we have to face here and the bottom line is, we all have to do whatever we can to make sure that we can continue to provide the Gesu experience to as many children in the area as possible.

MOD: John Dilulio.

JD: Well thank you again, Lou and Loraine, thank you very much for your kind introductions and, Bryan, it's always an honor to be here with you at what I call the "miracle factory." Welcome to the miracle factory because what happens here is a miracle. What happens here is, in the most cost-effective way imaginable, children come and they get a loving, caring first-rate education provided by people whose mission in life is to serve them. So in the 15 years that I've been associated with Gesu, I've never failed to be inspired by coming into this building and under your leadership, Bryan, the best is yet to come, so it's an honor to be here. I just want to say before I get started, I'm not going to speak too long, I am a professor so I can speak ten minutes, ten hours, say the same thing. I just want to say, not to just blow my own horn that since I was here last time I lost 50 pounds. During the same period I gained 75 but it's nothing to do with anything. And I just want to make an amendment to the Sister Ellen, yes, Lou, I agree she is Saint Ellen but when she is on the panel, she is supposedly shy and retiring, she's more like Oprah. So Sister Ellen don't get upset, I don't want you to charge the podium, I know you're back there, I see you. I love hanging out with nuns, I just don't make a habit of it. Okay. Enough. Let me do what I can do just by way of background. I'm going to just stipulate, I'm not a lawyer but I'm going to stipulate the way they do in law that we all agree that Catholic education makes a distinctive difference, educationally and in terms of character development. And that while there are many good schools and while there are many good public schools, traditional public schools, charter schools, other religious schools, that Catholic schools historically have made a special difference in the lives of millions and millions of people. What we are facing and what we are here to talk about today is the decline of urban Catholic education, and what if anything can be done to stem that decline, a decline that is fundamentally about finances. In 1960, nationally there were more than 5 million children enrolled and about 13,000 K through 12 Catholic schools. By 1990 that number was down to 2 ½ million and there are only about 8,700 of those schools left. And just last year in academic 2011-2012 nationally enrollment was down to

2 million and there are only about 6,800 schools left. This huge loss is obviously reflected here in the City of Brotherly Love, the city of the second great commandment. Since 2000 alone in this city we have nationally lost half a million seats and here in Philadelphia gone from 70's when we had 13 Catholic High Schools with 30,000 students, 129 parish grade schools with 75,000 students – today in Philadelphia just 30,000 or so. There are actually fewer students in Catholic schools in Philadelphia today K through 12 than there were just in Catholic high schools in the mid 1970's. This has been a dramatic, steep, a steady and a relentless decline and there is no blinking at it. Part of the story though as the plot thickens is that it's not just about a loss of schools that people and their fathers and grandfathers, mothers and grandmothers attended. We know that the story is more complicated than that, because about one in four of the children who are now in Philadelphia's Catholic grade schools are non-Catholic. Indeed about a third of the elementary schools, the K through 8 schools, in those a majority of the children are non-Catholic. So I want to just take a few minutes to say, to address a couple of the general arguments of what is this all about? The one argument is demography is destiny. Look white working class Irish, Italian, Polish moved to the suburbs, they took their money with them, they build ex-urban schools and they left their schools behind. And now that the children who are increasingly benefitting from Catholic education, the parents who are here, who are low-income, black, Latino and other who want these schools can't afford them. And so the schools are closing, demography is destiny. We also hear about the advent of the charter schools which now in Philadelphia have more children enrolled than the Catholic schools do, more than 30,000. That it's the charter school competition that is really the story. This decline started well before there were charter schools. And this decline began even before the demography became destiny. The one thing we need to understand and I'm going to just zero in on this and then try to turn my motor off as quickly as I can. There is no shortage of demand for Catholic education on the part of Philadelphia parents, no shortage. Sixty-two percent of the parents surveyed by the Pew Trusts a couple of years ago said they have actively sought alternatives for their children to the public schools. The Children's Scholarship Fund of Philadelphia provides the most interesting, I think, natural experiment in the data. There are 10,000 children, the Children's Scholarship Fund has done an incredible job, managing to get the funds to help support destination neutral, parents that want alternatives for their children to send them to any non-public school of their choice, parochial, other religious whatnot. Ten thousand is an amazing accomplishment but it's a lottery, it's like *Waiting for Superman*, it's a lottery. There have been over 100,000 applications and 70% of the Children's Scholarship Fund parents choose Catholic education, so you don't need to have higher math to understand that the implication is that the latent demand for Catholic education in this city is at least 70,000 families. In other words 70,000 families that for partial tuition and having to pay money out of their

own pockets said I will take that option and send my child to a Catholic school if I can just get that much financial help. If we had the funding to meet that latent demand we would be opening, we'd have to open Catholic schools that we've closed over the past 20 years. We would have to go to the book of saints names and come up with some new saint names. We'd have to really get busy. So, I want to suggest to you that the challenge is, you know it's fashionable to say the challenge is not financial, there is no magic bullet, complex problems don't have simple solutions, this one does. This one does and whether you want to seek that solution in the public sector by expanding educational investment, you know credits. If you want to talk about vouchers, if you want to talk about public/private partnerships, if you want to talk about the Catholic community itself and Catholic philanthropists and the need for more people to step up, I'll conclude not by quite plucking the beam from my own eye but plucking the beam from my own sector the higher education sector. I'm in the education business, I've been teaching colleges and universities for 30 years. Over the last 30 years every college and university in the country just about, and not just the secular elite ones, Catholic and other, have developed fairly robust, fairly muscular professional development operations. And now I'm going to be a little provocative and then I'll keep quiet. The Catholic universities and colleges have participated in this and it's to their great credit and glory. I adore them, I worship them, they're spectacular. But building new buildings in colleges and universities, in Catholic colleges and universities in the shadow of K through 12, Catholic K through 8 schools that have closed, raising billions and billions and billions of dollars for Catholic higher education while Catholic K through 8 that served predominately minority children in areas that once educated generation after generation of immigrants, there is a real intramural issue here for the Catholic community of educators to talk about and I hope maybe today we'll get to that as well as others, so let me turn my motor off for real. Thank you.

MOD: Thank you very much. Kim Flaville.

KF: Well, John, just to follow up that comment, and I had this thought a few years ago but what the heck why not just air it, in terms of higher Catholic education and all the wonderful things you said about them particularly the amount of funding that they raise, obviously the pipeline to higher Catholic education begins at the parish elementary school level. I think it would be wonderful if Catholic colleges and universities would take a look at how much they raise annually and commit a minimum of 1% to Catholic education. That was totally unplanned, but John opened the door so it's nice to walk through it. Well, good afternoon. I'll talk about Connelly Foundation and our executive vice president Emily Riley is here with us this afternoon as well. Connelly Foundation was founded by John Connelly and Josephine Connelly in 1955. Funding to Catholic institutions which includes education as well as health and human services has always

been at the forefront of the foundation's mission and that continues today. About three years ago this statement was made at a technology conference, and the statement was that "education is the last field to embrace technology." For me that statement revolutionized our thinking, my thinking specifically. We call technology a tool, how limiting, so going forward we determined to look through a lens containing three criteria. Goal one eliminate barriers; secondly increase access; third reduce costs. Those three criteria have broad application in terms of our capacity to award grants, develop programs that support Catholic education, particularly elementary schools and Archdiocesan high schools. So, we need to think along those terms, we will continue to do so. The topic today is financing futures. Connelly Foundation obviously is a foundation, we were instituted and the goal for ours as part of our by-laws, we are perpetual. Isn't that wonderful? So we're with you for the long haul.

MOD: Jason Budd.

JB: Good afternoon my name is Jason Budd. I'm the deputy secretary for Catholic education with the Archdiocese of Philadelphia, I'm joined today by my colleague Sister Edward Quinn, Director of Curriculum and instruction for the elementary schools. I'm very blessed and honored to be here today; in fact humbled is probably the best word. When I heard the biographies rattled off of my colleagues up here I immediately thought of the Sesame Street routine where which one of these doesn't belong, and right here some very well-credentialed people and I'll do my best to hold my own up here. I am a product of the Archdiocese of Philadelphia; I went to Saint Katherine of Siena Grade School in Northeast Philadelphia. I was lucky enough to attend my dream school in Father Judge High School. My father and my uncles had all attended Father Judge and I can remember reading the year books just as a young person growing up and hoping one day that I was going to be able to go there. Of all the things and of all the reasons that I hoped I never considered, ever, that my folks couldn't afford it. That was never anything that fed into the mind of a nine-, ten-, eleven- or twelve-year-old as you're anticipating that move from elementary school to high school. And I was lucky enough and my parents were able to afford the education despite the fact that my father had been unemployed for a time while we were in high school, my sister and I. As well as a time when I was in college, so I can completely understand and empathize with the plight of financing education on both side of the fence. I've had the rather unfortunate experience of being in an auditorium representing the managing body and having to announce the closure of inner-city schools, and I can tell you that it is the lowest point in my professional career. It comes with a great responsibility and professionalism, but it is certainly the lowest point in my career. Likewise, I was in an auditorium when we announced through the goodness of the Archbishop and the Faith in the Future Foundation that we were going to keep the schools, in this case the high schools, open and I cannot explain to you the

feeling of power, and I can't think of a better word, the feeling of power and empowerment that comes from watching young people get excited that their school is going to remain open, that they too have the same love and desire for their school that I once had. When you think of young people and you talk to young people outside of school and ask them how school is going, it's just rather natural for them to give, oh it's okay and not be effusive about it. But when you talk to students who go to Catholic schools there is a sense of pride, there is a sense of responsibility to represent their school and I can tell you that I've seen that. I have made it the goal of my career to never be in that auditorium of any school again announcing that a school is going to close. Now that is not something that is just as easily done as that. It is a great responsibility as outlined by my colleagues up here and it does simply boil down to finances. We know that there is a great demand for an alternative to public education. We know that the Catholic schools provide an excellent alternative to public education; we've been doing so for a number of years. But even this formula, which on some levels seems okay, for example at the high school level, here in Philadelphia, the Archdiocese, we have the lowest tuition nationwide for a system and the highest teacher salaries nationwide for a system. So you talk about efficiency, lowest tuition, highest teacher salaries, so you're getting the best people and charging the least amount. That is still not enough. We need to adapt that formula, a formula that is dated, a tuition formula that is dated, we have to adapt that for a changing educational landscape. And again, that's easier said than done, but we're living in times of great change and we're very thankful that there are some legislators out there who are willing to push the envelope, who are willing to help manifest change in the form of EITC and OSTC, which I'm sure we'll dialog about here today, but hopefully the end result of all of this work in those endeavors is something more resembling of a robust voucher program. One that really, truly allows a parent and a child to decide where they want to go, where they want to endeavor educationally, not based on where they live but where they want to be, and I will do my best along with my colleagues to see that that happens. Thank you.

MOD: Anne Marie Borneman.

AB: Brian, Sister Ellen and members of the Gesu community, thank you for having me to participate in this really important and very timely discussion. As Ms. Morrill said, I am the senior fellow at the Center for Catholic and Urban Education at Saint Joseph's University and I hope to have the opportunity to respond a little bit to what both John and Kim have raised that I think are very legitimate issues about higher education in Philadelphia. Our Center for Catholic and Urban Education is actually the first in the Philadelphia region, but it's not the first in the nation and we've modeled the center on similar programs at Boston College, University of Dayton, and Loyola University Chicago. We are committed to the continuation of Catholic schools in the Philadelphia

area. We believe that they are viable options for parents who really seek a values-based quality education for their children. Now the ways in which colleges and universities could support Catholic schools are varied and they range from direct partnerships and there are some of those relationships in the United States, sponsorships, we have one of those in the Philadelphia area, to consultation offering professional development, research opportunities as well as course offerings and degree programs for teachers and for administrators. What I think makes the center at Saint Joe's a little bit unique is that we're not out there trying to do this in a vacuum all by ourselves. We have called upon all of the colleges and universities in the area to form together in, not at this point I wouldn't say a consortium, but definitely a group of people to try to meet these needs of Catholic schools in the area. And to that end we have held two, what we call round table discussions, and we have another one coming up in January. We invite all of the area colleges and universities to send representatives of their education departments and they have. We've actually had college presidents sitting at our round table. We also invite representatives of various foundations, organizations that support Catholic education, such as BLOCS and Children's Scholarship Fund and also representatives from various Catholic school models in Philadelphia. We've accomplished a couple of things in our very brief time. One is that all of the ed departments of colleges and universities in Philadelphia joined together and drafted a letter to every Catholic school teacher who was at risk for being laid off last year when the mergers and closures were announced, offering their services helping with résumés, helping with transcripts. We found that a lot of the Catholic school teachers, while eligible to be credentialed never went through the process to get certified and so every single one of our Catholic colleges and universities offered support to help teachers. I don't have data on how many of our teachers took advantage of that, but it was our first step to say that the more we can do together, the better off we're going to be. As it relates to funding it's our belief at the center that higher education can help either schools use funds more efficiently or in some cases actually save funds outright. I'll give you one example of this, but there are many, and of course I'm just speaking for Saint Joe's, but we believe that our Alliance for Catholic Education Program (ACE SJU) saves local Catholic schools hundreds of thousands of dollars in salaries that can then go to various uses within that school. And of course the overall benefit is that we are infusing these schools with talented, committed and highly educated Catholic school teachers, hopefully future Catholic school leaders. I also wanted to mention not just Saint Joe's but all of the different area Catholic colleges and universities non-Catholic colleges and universities offer degree programs and most do have reduced tuition for Catholic school teachers and for administrators. At Saint Joe's we just started an online master's in Catholic school leadership and the emphasis again is that it's a little different Catholic school leadership than regular leadership but it results in a principal certification from the State of Pennsylvania. I hold that Catholic colleges and universities

are largely an untapped resource for the sustenance of Catholic schools in Philadelphia and further that pooling of these resources I think can result in a more profound effect. I'm going to close with a quote from Father Pedro Arrupe, the former Jesuit Superior General. "If our schools are to perform as they should, they will live in a continual tension between the old and the new, the comfortable past and the uneasy present." Thank you.

MOD: I do have one question and I do want to also again encourage our audience to please step up to the microphones if you have any comments or questions and you are invited to begin that process now as I ask this question. And I want to just say that Bryan sent me this article that I was very intrigued by and that is that the article indicated that the Archdiocese has handed over school management to an independent foundation which is the first time that has occurred in the history of the Archdiocese of Philadelphia with the aim of improving enrollment, improving the quality of education. However I wonder if you could maybe give some idea of your opinion on that, I think in the past as Philadelphia public schools have been kind of the laboratory for that, it has had some success and some failures and one phrase that stuck out at me was metrics and one of the things that I think we all agree on is Catholic education has a value and a uniqueness. And I guess my question is with this move into having a management organization oversee the Archdiocese is there a potential for that indefinable quality that we see here exemplified by the students that I've already met, is that potentially going to be impacted. Who would like to jump in, John?

JD: Sure, thank you. I think it could be and I think your question and Bryan's great article this morning, you've got another future in journalism and that was great, but you know there is a larger debate here about what do we do. Many of you here know the old Saint Clement's right, southwest Philly, out there on 71<sup>st</sup> and Woodland. It's now Southwest Leadership Academy, it's a charter school, and it's an incredible charter school I mean that's a great school they've got going there and the local church that's nearby they bought a lot of the rest of property there and converted it. The old convent is now a residential treatment center for kids with drug problems and whatnot and so the housing complex across the street that had become pretty deteriorated has been torn down and rebuilt and that transformation of that Catholic K through 8 school, which was a rival of our own Saint Barnabas back in the day in southwest Philly has really been an anchor in that community and part of its redevelopment and revitalization. There are a lot of people, and Miami has done this, that say let's go to metrics, let's go to a centralized management and lets actually, let try to charterize these schools but control who gets them and turn them into kind of quasi faith-based charters. I'm not ready to go there yet. I believe that there is something distinctive about education beneath the crucifix. I think there is something distinctive that will be lost; it's not that there is this amorphous x-

factor, but there is something about people who look upon every child and see the face of God in every person that makes a difference. And the more distressed the community the more impoverished, even the research would suggest that there's a difference there. So I'm not terribly concerned about the centralization or the management metrics per se, I'm more concerned about this notion that, well we could, nothing would be lost if we just have "quality schools" none of which happen to be Catholic.

MOD: Jason.

JB: Certainly an interesting question and I think we have to look at what we've all just said in the minutes leading up to the first question. We've all just said that the primary concern of these schools in these communities is raising finances to offset the cost of tuition. Nobody who finds their way to Catholic education as an employee, as a volunteer does so without having a deep zeal and passion for the Catholic faith and what they want to convey to those that are coming in. So what has happened over time is a large amount of our administrators have had to spend extensive amounts of days and hours and resources on just that task, making sure that the finances are there so they are there in the years to come. I think with the advent of the relationship with the Faith in the Future Foundation and believe me change comes hard to me sometimes and letting go and allowing somebody else to come in and cooperatively rule is a difficult thing to happen. But I think what you're going to see is those leaders at the local level specifically who have had to fret over a lot of these issues are now able to get back to the task that is most important and that is the manifestation of the faith in everyday life and passing that onto the kids and not worrying about, as much, the ledger sheets and making sure that the monies are coming in. So I see it as a positive in its relationship to the faith.

MOD: Kim, you had something you wanted to add.

KF I did, as you know we are church, right, so if the church is going to exist there has to be formation and that formation begins at the parish elementary schools, we hope those students continue their formation in Archdiocesan high schools and thereafter obviously seek a college education. So I hope church continues to pay attention to this formation program that they themselves developed centuries ago and I hope they continue to live up to its promise and support it. Church needs to continue to support its own formation program.

MOD: Bryan.

BC: In terms of Faith in the Future what they're going to look to do is become a stronger marketer and voice for all that is good about Catholic education and I feel as though from Gesu's perspective and mission schools and Catholic schools as a whole, we have to become more entrepreneurial so that people will know what is good about Catholic faith-

based education and what is so good about Gesu for example or Saint Malachy for example. So it comes down to taking a marketing entrepreneurial approach and looking at the positioning of your school and how when someone says Gesu, what is it that you want them to think. Or someone says Saint Malachy, what is it you want them to think in their mind. And in addition then to developing or identifying through facts about your school what the position is, then driving the messages home to the internal stakeholders, our students so that they can go out and talk glowingly about what they experienced in the Catholic school to our stakeholders externally so that they can then talk about what happens in the Catholic school. So for example, just as an example, if someone said Gesu to you folks there, you would probably say it's an independent Catholic school where the children start here academically behind and go onto to soar to do great things and go to outstanding schools. That's just as example, you can use that if you'd like, but that's what we have to do. Become more entrepreneurial so that people will know what happens in the Catholic school, what the benefits are, what would happen if a Catholic school in the inner city no longer existed. And talking about the church aspect here at Gesu, probably less than two or three percent of our students are Catholic but what the students in the inner-city Catholic schools, and it's probably the same percentage in a lot of the inner-city Catholic schools, what they do receive besides academic rigor and discipline and order is they receive a religious education. They grow not only academically but they grow spiritually so whether our students leave here and become Catholic, which some of them do, or not, they know spiritual growth has taken place here. They know right from wrong. They know how to be a man or woman for others just like it's taught here at Gesu as a Jesuit school, an IHM school. So that's what's critical in terms of metrics, the only metric that I'm concerned about is when our children leave Gesu, what school do they go to and do they go to a top school. That's the only metric and outcome I'm concerned with.

MOD: Anne Marie.

AM: First of all, I was baptized at Saint Clement's, so it was very sad to see that close. I agree first and foremost we are Catholic schools, but for so long and I think this comes up at every Gesu symposium, we've been able to just say that we're safe and nurturing schools and we can no longer just be safe and nurturing schools and just be Catholic schools. We have to be academically excellent and that does involve testing, measuring and assessment. Fortunately or unfortunately and that's a reality that's going to be important for our donor base and it's going to be important if these schools are going to survive and if our students are going to be successful and be able to get into competitive high schools and go onto college.

MOD: At this time I'd like to ask our audience to join the conversation. Who would like to break the ice and be the first one to ask a question or make a comment? Okay, well come on up to the microphone, or someone is bringing a microphone to you. Tell us who you are.

Aud 1: My name is Angelo S\_\_\_ I live in the neighborhood. I wonder if Mr. Carter could comment on the \$3 million that you have to raise every year and what are the sources of that \$3 million.

BC: Thank you for asking. We have, as I said, we're a tuition-based school, however the parents can't afford to pay that tuition, a significant portion of it. We have, one key driver is our Sponsor a Child campaign by which we introduce Gesu to potential donors, individuals who are interested in learning more about Gesu and they come through the school and they see how dedicated the children are, they walk through the classrooms, they see the faculty at work and then those individuals say, I would like to sponsor a child and pay the portion of the tuition that the campaign or the program calls for. So that's one of the major drivers, and then we have our typical annual fund and galas that are involved in terms of development. Also critical is the EITC and OSTC programs now, so for EITC that's the Educational Improvement Tax Credit and we benefit from that. The bigger opportunity for us now and for all of the inner-city Catholic schools is the Opportunity Scholarship Tax Credit because that is focused solely on inner-city schools essentially because you have to be in an area where there is a persistently poor performing school, persistently poor performing public school. Gesu and typically the inner-city locations where our schools are surrounded by those types of school, so that's an opportunity as well for us to get additional funding. But primarily it's through our scholarship campaign, it's through our typical annual fund and gala development opportunities and now with this new Opportunity Scholarship Tax Credit that's even a greater possibility for funding.

MOD: Alright, who has our next question or comment? Yes.

Aud 2: [Portions inaudible] I just wanted to ask you Bryan, you talked about the Opportunity Scholarship Tax Credit and we're getting to the deadline of, our school takes advantage of that as well but we're having a hard time really getting the word out, really getting it publicized and getting people to invest in the opportunity of the scholarship program. Can you give us some ideas on how people are really taking advantage of that incentive and how you could go about it?

BC: Thank you for that question as well. The opportunity is to educate the businesses, they're really not aware of what it means, but for example since we're sharing best practices we've been able to identify businesses who have given us EITC funding, bring those individuals back in, be it a breakfast and a tour, be it a breakfast and they have an opportunity to be introduced to our choir and share with them how easy it is to go ahead

and apply for Opportunity Scholarship Tax Credits as well. But it's a big education process, it's not too late because there is a significant amount of the money still left, at least \$30 million so there is still the opportunity. I know our friends at BLOCS are doing an education process as well with the schools to make sure that the schools reach out and the parents reach out to even local businesses to try and get them to take advantage of the Opportunity Scholarship Tax Credit as well. But it's more of an education for the businesses and then typically you may have a better opportunity if you go back to a business that supports you already with EITC.

MOD: Okay.

KF: Obviously we all know how unique Gesu is. The fact that it raises \$3 million a year certainly separates it from the other city parish elementary schools, not only in Philadelphia but even the five county wide. Probably the school that comes closest to that as a parish elementary school is Saint Francis de Sales and we have obviously Sister Constance and Jeanette are here with us today. So Connelly Foundation has engaged with the Catholic School Development Project over in New Jersey and we have certainly have development efforts going on in six parish elementary schools. We think truly and actually we have development directors in three inner-city schools replicating the fellows program out of the Archdiocese of New York. So I think going forward parishes and I think everybody is coming to this, you also have to have development efforts as well. Obviously these schools are learning to execute annual funds, they're learning to have different events, they are building boards. And so I think that is going to continue to be part and parcel of what will help Catholic schools going forward, do their own financing whether it's for tuition assistance, whether it's for creating more academic programs so I think that, you know several years ago I understand all parish elementary schools were to form a board and I think that's been a slower process and we know it's challenging. Schools are very closely situated together. I think if we sit down together and think about how we might do that for parishes that are so closely I think we can come up with a good solution and a collaborative effect and have collaborative boards exactly. So I just wanted to mention that. Again, everybody here would love to be like Gesu and raise \$3 million a year, but that's a long way off, so we just need, and I use this term, because everybody talks about sustainability, right? Isn't that the big term. It's a tough term, think about it. Everybody is struggling every single day with sustainability so I'm going to change your thinking just a little bit today and I love this term, it's called adaptive resiliency. You always have to change and you always have to grow. So think in those terms and I think it will help you through the process.

BC: Let me emphasize one more thing, we do have to raise \$3 million every year. We still need significant help so I wanted to make sure that was understood.

MOD: John?

JD: Actually we need \$3 million worth of help every year is what we need.

BC: Yes we do. Yes we do.

JD: Let me just say and I think we've all said it, first of all I want to just quickly shout out to Saint Joe's and the ACE program. We at Saint Penn's, better known as University of Pennsylvania, we have had a hand in that and it's a remarkable program and I must say, and I will single out and say that in this metropolitan region Saint Joe's has been far and away the leader in thinking about how to support and sustain and strengthen K through 12 Catholic education in ways direct and indirect. Other Catholic colleges and universities have too, but I know having been on the board of the college at Saint Joe's how much they've done. But I just wanted to say you know what this is getting to and what Kim's comment advances and I think really from your comments as well, Jason, that when I was, as soon I got out of the White House in 2001, which was a glorious day, I took about half a year and one of the things I did was I accepted an invitation to be on the domestic policy steering committee of the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops. Now I learned two things from that experience. One is that I wouldn't want to be a bishop, not that anybody asked, but they have, they run little cities and they have incredibly tough jobs and everybody, I mean I would have such sympathy for them I mean it is an incredibly difficult job. They are the CEOs, we don't often think about them that way, of these incredible complex organizations with schools and hospitals and nonprofits, all this stuff. One of the things I would say to the eminences when they'd give me a chance to speak was that I really felt, I understood when I was in the White House how much they cared about a conscience clause for Catholic hospitals. I mean I don't think three days went by when I didn't get a call saying, when are you going to give us our conscience calls for the 600 Catholic hospitals. And they have other priorities and I know again they have a very complex set of things they need to worry about. But the thing I said to them then and I've said it in public since so I don't hesitate to say it now, is that K through 12 education really occupied a more ambiguous position with them. There were those and now like I would single out for example not only our own bishop here, archbishop in Philadelphia who is I think trying to do everything he possibly can but, Bishop Gallante over there in Camden, you take him out of the mix and I don't even know if we have any Catholic schools left, the Camden Schools Partnership all those incredible efforts by so many people, but you know the bishops have to focus and be engaged and there is a sense in which that attention has been somewhat episodic. The reason that's important is that it's important politically because to get the Educational Investment Tax Credit, to get the new scholarship and to open up the discussion about something as controversial as why can't Catholic institutions, Catholic leadership, our Catholic nonprofits, why can't they be the leadership and management of a charter

school? There is a tremendous law review article *Cardozo Law Review* article<sup>1</sup> if you're really interested in, if you have insomnia a lot of foot notes, by Aaron Saiger who is a Fordham Law professor who happens to be an Orthodox Jew so as Aaron would tell you, I have no dog in this fight, but he has written an article that is forthcoming in the *Cardozo Law Review* arguing the case, following the Zelman decision of 2002, that constitutionally it would be kosher for Catholic institutions to charterize, lead and manage K through 12 schools. Now I know that's a bit of a flash point controversy but there it is, by Aaron Saiger in the *Cardozo Law Review*. We've got to start having these kinds of conversations.

Aud 3: My name is John Ryan and I'm probably the oldest living alumnus of this school present here today. One point that I have considered a great deal. First of all, I had the federal government pay for me to go to a Catholic college for four years. So there are cases where the government has funded people to get a Catholic education, but I think that may be a good way off. What I would suggest is either alternate parish schools or bifurcate a parish school, have an elementary school K to 4 where you have religious training and you get no money. Have 5 to 8 where it's not religious, you're charterized and you'll get more money from the Board of Education School Reform Commission and then \$3 million that you need to run all eight grades right now.

MOD: That's an intriguing idea. Anyone have a comment on that?

KF: Actually we had met several years ago with Win Churchill and even just during the conversation, because they were trying to determine whether or not they could. No, they were thinking charter, they were thinking charter at the time and it just happened that I said well gee why wouldn't we? Because Catholic schools start PreK-3 now, not everybody, but it's at least PreK-3, PreK-4, I think in the whole City of Philadelphia there is only one Catholic school that does not have PreK yet. So I said gee why wouldn't, it's just what you said, John. Why wouldn't we do the formation PreK through 4, we actually had a wonderful conversation with Marc Mannella who thought, he was thrilled because he thought oh my God I'll get kids that can read, and kids that can do math, I won't have to start back several grades, but soon as they got additional charter school seats that just began to, you know not become the current topic anymore.

JD: It's funny I have these debates in public and in private and some say well there is no precedent for anything even close to that kind of a mixed model or whatnot. I said well there's the GI bill. You can go to Yeshiva you can go to Notre Dame, you can go to Brandeis, you'll be theologically confused if you go to all those but you can go. And even in the City of Philadelphia its interesting, you know if a child gets into difficulty and ends up for example at one of the, like Saint Gabriel's, right. Well then we can educate them, then, and get paid to educate them, then. But we can't educate them in first grade, second

grade, third grade, hmm. What would happen constitutionally in that, oh at this point you were willing to stand down on that, so I'm being a little provocative. I'll stop.

MOD: We like provocative, nothing like a good conversation. Yes.

Aud 3: I've been involved in Catholic education since I've been 22 years old and that's a long time ago. I have a comment for the panel and a concern of mine and that is the elementary Catholic school teacher and our support of the elementary school teacher although I know, Jason, the salary for the high school teachers may be one of the highest in the nation, our Catholic elementary school teachers are not privileged to that and I work with these teachers every day, I see many running off to a second job to provide for their families. So that is a big concern to me if we are going to go forward with excellent schools on the backs of excellent teachers who are well prepared. Not compensated perhaps as well as public education but enough that would not require them to go to a second job. And again I see a lot of that, I have a big concern and I'm hoping that Catholic universities, Faith in the Future, or as we're raising our millions of dollars to repair our buildings and subsidize tuition we have to look at what support is being given to our Catholic elementary school teachers in particular is my passion right now and I just wanted to make that comment and somehow represent them here that I think they have to be part of this discussion.

MOD: Thank you very much. Yes, Jason.

JB: I'd just like to echo Ellen's sentiments and say that I don't think any of our teachers are paid anywhere near what they're worth, secondary or elementary. And that's certainly not to play to the crowd. It's God's honest truth. When I referred to the secondary schools I was making the point that the efficiency of it but if we were to double that pay we still wouldn't get close to what they're worth. The elementary school obviously is in a different situation and it's not one that favors the teacher but it certainly speaks to the teachers' zeal and passion for what they do. The first thing I learned when I became a teacher at the secondary level was that you had to have a second job to support your teaching habit. It's a rather unfortunate occurrence but I do applaud the teachers that day in and day out do work that second job or third job in many cases to support what they do and what they believe in and anything we can do to support them we will continue to be innovative to try to do so.

MOD: Raise their salaries you said, okay.

BC: Well here at Gesu we take a serious look at the opportunities to raise funds so that we can compensate the faculty members appropriately. It comes with the fund raising as well so our teachers are very dedicated to the mission that we have in terms of serving the children in this particular area with a quality education, but it's not lost on me that we

need to compensate the teachers in a much stronger way. We're fortunate to have a, we talked about partnerships, we're fortunate to have a strategic partnership, or a partnership with Saint Joseph's University so that one of the benefits we can offer our faculty members is the opportunity to get a free master's degree in education through Saint Joseph's University. If you add the cost of that onto the salary, I know you can't buy a loaf of bread with that, but that's one of the ways we try to help in terms of the compensation but we're always, I'm always looking at the opportunity to try and make an increase in the salaries, it's not lost on us for sure.

Break in recording

MOD: It sounds like there needs to be a partnership between the schools and the Catholic colleges to provide the same kind of benefit that obviously Gesu offers to their teachers. I saw a student over there that raised your hand. Yes, tell us your name and what's your question or comment.

Aud 4: My name is Monique A\_\_ and my question was, what objective do you think we should turn to, to help finance more Catholic elementary schools?

MOD: Oh what do we need to do in order to finance Catholic elementary schools, what strategies?

KF: We're doing some innovative things at Connelly Foundation. We have a program called Math Matters with Sister Edward Quinn's blessing. This is an opportunity for us to identify in parish elementary schools top students. Not every parish elementary school offers what we call honors math, there's pretty strict criteria for that. But this still takes a look at top math students in parish elementary schools. We have what we call one great teacher. We have one great teacher who is teaching via high definition telecommunications equipment at five parish elementary schools. So she has a home base at Resurrection and simultaneously she is teaching students at Saint Martin of Tours, Saint Peter's, Saint Theo's, the former Saint Richard's, and there is a fifth school. But anyway. De Sales, no de Sales is in our second cohort. We have two cohorts. We have nine schools all together, so we have actually two great teachers now. So we have one teaching five schools, one teaching four schools and Connelly Foundation always fully funds the pilot. So we put all the high definition telecommunications equipment in those schools, and I'll do an average, maybe that type teacher who has great math credentials, her salary might be \$40,000. As this progresses if there are five schools, what would it cost them to share, right? \$8,000 a year, that's one way we are reducing costs, so when Connelly Foundation determines that we have fully funded this they can then have that conversation, so they could get this type program for \$8,000 so that's an amazing cost savings. In other counties we are talking to schools saying, start trading. If you have

honors math trade it for Spanish and this is working quite nicely out in the county schools and we obviously could replicate that in the city as well. So there obviously your cost benefit is getting something, a subject that you didn't have as part of your curriculum whether it be art, whether it be music but it's a barter system and actually our pilot shows that it works incredibly well and this can be replicated quite easily through partnerships.

MOD: Anne Marie.

AM: I'm sorry I missed your name but it's the perfect question because here we are at this symposium and we're addressing exactly this issue, so thank you for raising the question and know that you have many people in this room who are working really hard on this and we're not going to let all the Catholic schools go away. So there is lots of effort and certainly lots of passion and I think we've all seen that here today, so thank you for asking the question, but don't worry. It's gonna be okay. We're the adults. We'll make sure it's okay.

JB: I think the question was an excellent question as well. I think there's a three pronged attack here, obviously many of us in a position of management and fund raising would love to hit the home run, you know we want the million dollar donor who comes in and sees and has the breakfast and is there committed for life, and that certainly you have to swing for the fences a lot in these positions. EITC, OSTC, to me with what we have right now, that's what we have to work with, and we've got to work that day in and day out, that's like the equivalent of the double or the triple, okay. But just as important in all of this to continue with the baseball reference is the ability to play small ball and I think we really need to wrap our arms around that particularly in the inner city and one of the things that we're trying to do and I know that Gesu has done as well, is to really take advantage of the neighborhood that you're in and develop partnerships with your local small businesses. Okay and we have schools right now and businesses right now working together. Those businesses aren't able to hit that home run for the school, they aren't able to donate the maximum to OSTC at \$300,000, \$400,000. They're not able to give the million dollar donation over the course of five years. But they are able to do little things based on what their business is. We have local banks in certain neighborhoods of the city which are sponsoring entrepreneurial programs wherein before and after school they're teaching business courses, entrepreneurial courses with the intent that three, four, five years from now these students graduate and come to them for small business startup loans and it's a cyclical environment that we have working here. So it's important to swing for the fences, it's important to play the small game but it's also very important to embrace the neighborhood you're in and take advantage of what your neighborhood has to offer by way of small businesses. In the City of Philadelphia even though we're not immune from the economic crisis that we're still trying to climb out of, we have some neighborhoods that have really taken a couple of steps. West Philadelphia is changing

rapidly. Small businesses are increasing drastically in West Philadelphia as a result of the growth of groups like Penn and Drexel. There are neighborhoods that, obviously Northern Liberties and Manayunk, over the years who have demonstrated growth and growth of small businesses, so embracing those businesses, making them part of the school community and getting them to the table not as the home run hitter but as the guy who can lay down the bunt or the single here and there and that adds up. So it's a very good question.

MOD: Before you answer that question I just wanted to ask a final question as we begin to close down this panel discussion, it's probably one of the more controversial questions that has remained unsaid and that is the issue of vouchers. It's a situation or an issue that has often pitted public against private and or public against parochial and I wonder briefly if you could just speak to that as to where is it that the intersection can occur so that there is not that adversarial situation where public school thinks of vouchers as being a threat to public schools, etc. So who would like to take that one on?

JD: I'd love to take that one on. Let me say and again that was a spectacular question, I think it links up with your question about vouchers, which in the past we've discussed here or more explicitly at the Gesu symposium. My answer is I have three solutions, big solutions, one is gone, I didn't hit Powerball. I was close, I had half of one number and they wouldn't even give me three dollars. I have one private and one public and the public one is going to get to this question of vouchers, the private idea which I've been floating for years and nobody has taken me up on it and I expect they're going to any time soon. Is there are all these experiments, scholarship funds around the country and there is lots of private money that's going and everybody loves their own city and everybody has their favorite schools and we all know how that goes. I have said over and over again that there is no city in America like the City of Philadelphia with respect to the remaining infrastructure of non-public education, not just Catholic, but the whole infrastructure: Quaker schools, Friends' schools, other independent schools. If the folks who are funding at smaller scales all of these different experiments and expansions of privately-funded scholarship-based education would concentrate their forces in just one place and make it the demonstration site, and I nominate Philadelphia, what they would demonstrate is what I talked about earlier, is just how profound that latent demand is so that is there was no longer a lottery, if there was just one place in America just one place where children who had parents who are waiting for Superman could stop waiting and the country looked at what happened when you put it on an equal funding basis, I think the demonstration effect of that would permanently change the discussion and the discourse and the debate. Which leads me to my other, which is the voucher question. Look, the reason we have this debate and I'm a huge fan of public education in Philadelphia we have a public school district that does an incredible job often with very tough

circumstances, limited resources. But alas it's a 3.3 billion-dollar-a-year operation, okay, 3.3 and change, billion-dollars-a-year operation. So we're talking here about strictures against vouchers and school choice that in the case of the Catholics we have to remember our history. Go back to Nativists and Know-Nothings in the 19<sup>th</sup> century and early 20<sup>th</sup> century who burned Catholic churches and inserted into state constitutions, including this one, provisions known as Blaine Amendments named after James G. Blaine the big fat liar from the state of Maine, I'm still not over it. Those provisions are still in those constitutions, they're still invoked by people who don't even know where they came from, saying why we can't have these kind of public-private partnerships. So here is the deal, let's have scholarships, vouchers and set them at whatever the per capita public school cost is point five, just give us point five, because all these children who are in these Catholic schools still the 2 million nationally, every one of those children are saving the tax payers money. Okay, we're getting school choice, so let's just peg it at point five and then let people make a choice. Are people really afraid that an organization that is going to provide the same service to children for half the cost is going to out compete them? They must really think a lot of these Catholic schools.

MOD: Anyone else?

BC: The public school system in Philadelphia is in trouble right now and they'll be closing 40 public schools in a couple of months, so my position is that why should a student or a family not be able to exercise choice when they are tied to a zip code in which there are persistently poor performing schools. People that are making the decisions as to whether or not a voucher bill will be approved don't live in those zip codes. They made the choice to move to a zip code where their children will have a quality education, yet they're going to make the decision for other families who because of economic situations are tied to a zip code in which there are poor performing schools, in which there is high poverty which comes along with violence and all the other factors, they're going to make the decision for those children and families when they themselves have made the choice to probably live in an area where there are great schools. Some people may be even further blessed to be able to send their child to a private school that's an even greater school. Yet and still the people that live in this zip code and in the inner cities don't have the opportunity to make a choice because of the zip code that they reside in.

MOD: Jason, I'm going to give you the last word.

JB: At the risk of being redundant I'll say that obviously I am for vouchers as well. Recent empirical data studies showed that of the 18 states that had a voucher program, a robust voucher program, 17 of those states saw marked improvement in the students who matriculated from the public schools to the non-public schools and that's what they were looking for obviously, the group that was doing the study was hoping that was what they

would find, because they were supporting the study in the hopes that it would support the fight for vouchers. What they weren't looking for helped their fight more than anything, and that was in the public school systems where those kids left, those performances, those grades went up too. Why is that? Because it's an open market and free competitive system the basis of the country, except in education and it forced those public schools to evaluate what they were doing right, what they were doing wrong and get better. I can't point to a better win-win situation for the educational system of Philadelphia than that.

MOD: With that, I'd like to join in thanking all of our wonderful panel members, a very stimulating conversation, very thoughtful words and finally I'm going to ask Bryan Carter to provide some final words as we close out this seminar.

BC: First of all, thank you to all of our panelists, and Kim I want to make one request that if you need one more school for that Math Matters, one more great school to include in that pilot, please look at Gesu. It's an important issue and one that dogs each and every one of us every day and so I'm appreciative of the questions that were asked because it made us take a deeper moment and think about how we can go about funding inner-city schools. But I'm also concerned that we don't have the opportunity to get in front of someone to talk about vouchers again to reignite that discussion because that really will help save the Catholic schools if we can have a voucher discussion and have that reignited. So thank you again for coming to this symposium and I want to say a special thank you to John because this really was his innovation 15 years ago when we first had these symposiums, so I'm glad you were able to participate in the 15<sup>th</sup> annual symposium. And please do stay and enjoy the reception. Thank you very much.

<sup>1</sup> Aaron Saiger, *Charter Schools, The Establishment Clause, and the Neoliberal Turn in Public Education*, 34 *Cardozo L. Rev.* \_\_\_\_ (forthcoming April 2013).